

FM REVIEW 2019 7 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: This essay, written by an undergraduate premedical student, describes her disillusionment and subsequent reinvigoration with a career in medicine. Her questioning is triggered by the death of her pediatrician, which reminds her that physicians are not invincible and medicine is not all-powerful. Her return to the fold results from a moving encounter with a cancer patient.

The essay is well-written and shows awareness and insight. However, I am recommending rejection for two reasons. First, its focus is a pediatrician, which is not ideal for a family medicine journal. Second, although the essay is sincere and heartfelt, it contains little that constitutes truly new insights for an audience of family medicine educators. I'd encourage this student to keep writing!

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: This essay describes a cycle of enthusiasm, disillusionment, and subsequent reinvigoration with a career in medicine. The initial attraction is represented by trying on the physician-father's white coat and feeling it was "right"; the questioning is triggered by the death of your trusted pediatrician, which reminds you that physicians are not invincible and medicine is not all-powerful. Your return to pursuit of medicine results from a moving encounter with a cancer patient.

The essay is well-written and shows awareness and insight. However, I don't think it is right for this journal for two reasons. First, its focus is on a pediatrician, although this is a family medicine journal; so there is something of a mismatch here. Second, the journal's readers are experienced family medicine practitioners and educators; although the essay is sincere and heartfelt, it does not contribute sufficiently original insights to hold the attention of this sophisticated audience.

I encourage you to keep writing. You are a strong writer with a clear voice. I predict you will have much to say about your journey in medicine.